April 1, 2003

Mr. Michael F. Miller Assistant City Attorney P.O. Box 779 Galveston, Texas 77553-0779

OR2003-2180

Dear Mr. Miller:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 178693.

The City of Galveston (the "city") received a request for "the report on the investigation of several Galveston fire fighters... conducted by Texas Premier Investigations..." You claim that the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.103 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

We first note that the requested information was the subject of a previous ruling from this office. In Open Records Letter No. 2003-0852 (2003), we concluded that the city was required to withhold the submitted information contained in Exhibits 1, 3, and 4, consisting of information maintained solely in the fire department's confidential internal file, pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 143.089(g) of the Local Government Code. In Open Records Letter No. 2003-0852 (2003), we also concluded that the city must withhold Texas license plate numbers under section 552.130, and that the city must withhold the home address, home telephone number, and social security number of a current or former employee under section 552.117 if the employee made a request for confidentiality under section 552.024 prior to the date on which the request for this information was received by the city. We also concluded that certain information relating to firefighters who were suspended must be released to the requestor.

We understand you to represent that the circumstances existing at the time of the issuance of this ruling have not changed and that, consequently, the four criteria for a "previous determination" established by this office in Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001) have been met in this situation. Therefore, the city must withhold the submitted information previously excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.117, and 552.130 in accordance with Open Records Letter No. 2003-0852 (2003). See Gov't Code § 552.301(f); Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001). The remaining submitted information must be released in accordance with Open Records Letter No. 2003-0852 (2003). See Gov't Code § 552.301(f); Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001). As our previous ruling was dispositive, we do not address your arguments regarding disclosure.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. Id. § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. Id. § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. Id. § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877)673-6839.

The four criteria for this type of "previous determination" are 1) the records or information at issue are precisely the same records or information that were previously submitted to this office pursuant to section 552.301(e)(1)(D) of the Government Code; 2) the governmental body which received the request for the records or information is the same governmental body that previously requested and received a ruling from the attorney general; 3) the attorney general's prior ruling concluded that the precise records or information are or are not excepted from disclosure under the Act; and 4) the law, facts, and circumstances on which the prior attorney general ruling was based have not changed since the issuance of the ruling. See Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001).

The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Department of Public Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.--Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512)475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,

Cindy Nettles

Assistant Attorney General Open Records Division

CN/jh

Ref: ID# 178693

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Richard Massey
Galveston County Daily News
8522 Teichman Road
Galveston, Texas 77554
(w/o enclosures)